

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 326 782

CG 022 992

AUTHOR Kizielewicz, Nancy
TITLE A Study of Mothers and Adolescent Daughters in African American Families.
SPONS AGENCY American Association for Counseling and Human Development Foundation, Alexandria, VA.
PUB DATE 88
NOTE 51p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Tests/Evaluation Instruments (160)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC03 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Adolescents; *Black Mothers; Comparative Analysis; *Daughters; Family Relationship; Kinship; Parent Aspiration; Parent Attitudes; *Parent Child Relationship; Parent Role; Sociocultural Patterns; Socioeconomic Status
IDENTIFIERS *African Americans

ABSTRACT

This study examined characteristics of the relationship between mothers and adolescent daughters in 24 African American families--12 middle class and 12 working class--and compared these findings to similar past research done on white middle class mother-daughter dyads. Specific questions addressed in this study were constructed around recurring mother-daughter themes regarding communication, conflict, and the expression of affection. Interviews were conducted separately with mothers and daughters, and focused on five areas of the mother-daughter relationship: (1) time spent together; (2) definition and implication of roles; (3) the communication process; (4) expectations for self and other; and (5) feelings about the relationship and about each other. Based on the interviews, mothers and daughters were each classified into four mutually exclusive types based on the predominant theme in the ideas and beliefs expressed in the interview. Findings revealed a consistent relationship between orientation and the nature of mother-daughter interactions within identified classifications, further ordered with respect to social class. (References are included, and interview protocols are appended.) (TE)

* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *

ED326782

A Study
of
Mothers and Adolescent Daughters
in
African American Families

by

Nancy Kizielewicz, Ed.D., N.C.C.

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION
CENTER (ERIC)

- ☒ This document has been reproduced as
received from the person or organization
originating it.
☐ Minor changes have been made to improve
reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this docu-
ment do not necessarily represent official
OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS
MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Sandi Wurtz

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES
INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

CG022992

I would like to express a sincere thank you to:

The Counseling and Human Development Foundation for agreeing to fund this important research. Money from this grant was used to support the interviewing and transcription of data. Three graduate students in the Counselor Education Department at the State University of New York, College at Brockport were employed with grant monies. I am pleased and grateful to be able to continue the research which began with my dissertation.

Lonnie Mathis for her encouragement of me during the theoretical stages of this research. Lonnie also interviewed the first group of mothers and daughters.

Georgia A. Brooks, who completed the second half of the interviews and devoted hours of time and energy to the process of coding the transcripts and discussing theory and implications with me. Georgia was always present, supportive and insightful.

Cindy Entz for her patience and endurance in transcribing the hours of taped interviews.

Fred Medina, the school counselor and my loving husband, for helping in the selection of mothers and daughters to be interviewed.

The mothers and daughters of this study who enthusiastically welcomed us into their lives. I am grateful for their honesty and depth of sharing. This study was enriched by their willingness to allow others to learn from their experiences.

INTRODUCTION

The mother-daughter relationship and its role in the development of women has been a source of inquiry in contemporary research beginning with Freud in the nineteenth century and continuing to the present. Extensive theory and research regarding this family dyad has been generated by both psychological and sociological disciplines.

The primary focus of research from the psychological community has been the process of separation and individuation within the mother-daughter relationship. Horney (1967), Chodorow (1978) and Mahler (1982) are examples of theorists who have presented information about the process of separation and individuation in the development of women. Separation and individuation is the process through which the daughter develops an identity separate from that of her mother, and becomes autonomous. The common theme throughout this paradigm is the emphasis on the universality of the difficulty of separation and individuation for both mothers and daughters.

In addition to research presenting the mother-daughter relationship as a common universal phenomenon, two dominant belief systems about the mother-daughter relationship exist in research. One perspective (ex. Fischer, 1986; Walker & Thompson, 1983) supports the concept of the potential existence of an idyllic mother-daughter relationship. Another perspective (ex. Caplan, 1981; Gilbert & Webster,

1982; Lerner, 1985) emphasizes the belief that the mother-daughter relationship develops in an atmosphere of adversity.

The existence of only two primary belief systems ignores the possible variations which occur between the idyllic and adversary mother-daughter relationships.

Despite the lack of research which focuses specifically on variations within the mother-daughter relationship, some research has been generated from the sociological community regarding variations in parenting practices in general. Dannefer (1986), Duvall (1946), Elder and Bowerman (1963), Gecas (1979), and Kohn (1977) are examples of researchers who have studied parenting practices while considering social class as a possible independent variable. These researchers have suggested that class differences are apparent in the values or "standards of desirability" (Kohn, 1977 p.18) and subsequent practices of parents in relation to their children. Research findings have been quite consistent in the suggestion that middle class parents value internal development while working class parents tend to value externally imposed standards.

In a recent study, Kizielewicz (1988) conducted intensive interviews with 24 mothers and adolescent daughters. Kizielewicz (1988) identified variations within the mother-daughter relationship in respect to beliefs which mothers and daughters held about their relationship, interactions between mothers and daughters, and social class.

Furthermore, an interrelationship between these beliefs, social class and mother-daughter interactions was also identified. Working class mothers from intact families stressed rules and structure, while middle class mothers and working class mothers who were single parents emphasized communication and relationship enhancement in their relationships with their daughters.

The purpose of this current study was to describe the similarities and differences in the process which occurs as mothers and adolescent daughters in African American families relate to each other in respect to communication, conflict, and the expression of affection. This research represents an examination of the current interactions of 24 mother-daughter pairs from African American families. These women agreed to participate in an intensive interview process. The purpose of the present study was to offer a descriptive account of the characteristics of African American mother-daughter relationships in middle and working class dyads. The present research also replicates and assesses the applicability of the theory generated in the Kizielewicz (1988) study.

Furthermore, since research on mothers and daughters has been limited to the study of white middle class dyads. The field of multi-cultural counseling will be enhanced by information resulting from this study. Information from this study will aid in the assessment of the applicability of existing theory regarding the mother-adolescent daughter in relationship to African American families, and will generate

theory to be tested and used when counseling African Americans.

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The theoretical framework and methodology for the present study is an outgrowth of a study conducted by this researcher (Kizielewicz, 1988). The earlier research presented a viable model which was replicated and enriched in the present study. Specific questions addressed in this study through the interview process were constructed around recurring, substantive mother-daughter themes in current research and writings about the mother-daughter relationship. Fischer (1981) addressed the symbolic and interactional dimensions of the mother-daughter relationship. These areas of investigation were also discussed in other feminist writings (e.g. Arcana, 1979; Fischer, 1986).

Themes regarding communication, topics of disagreement, and the process of arguing have been consistently addressed in feminist writings (ex. Arcana, 1979, Gilbert & Webster, 1982) and more recently have been discussed in the context of the separation-individuation process (Caplan, 1981; Lerner, 1985; Tannen, 1986). Each of these theorists has framed arguing and disagreements within the mother-daughter relationship as a necessary manifestation of the process of separation and individuation at work. Caplan (1981) asserts that the mother-daughter bond is so strong that separation and independence can only be achieved through conflict.

Lerner (1985) suggests that expressions of separateness and independence through disagreements and arguments are ways of keeping in contact while asserting differences. Oftentimes, says Lerner (1985), the arguing which seems to create distance between mother and daughter is what each is relying upon to hold the relationship together. The concept of arguing and disagreeing as a necessary and constructive force in the mother-daughter relationship is a relatively new perspective. Increased knowledge about the ways in which arguing occurs, and the functions of disagreements in the mother-daughter relationship will enhance women's understanding of yet another aspect of this complex relationship.

Another construct included in this study, and investigated in the interview process, is the role of affection in the mother-daughter relationship. Affection and caring between mothers and daughters is alluded to in many current writings (e.g. Arcana, 1979; Fischer, 1986; Kizielewicz, 1988; Lerner, 1985). When affection and caring are discussed, however, in the context of separation and individuation, each is presented as an opposite dimension of conflict. Little information is available about the ways in which mothers and daughters express caring and affection to each other. This construct was addressed in the interview process in an effort to present information about an important and thus far neglected dimension of the mother-daughter relationship.

The Types

The data from the earlier study (Kizielewicz, 1988) was conceptually organized by typologies of orientation. These classifications were used as a viable model for conceptualizing the orientations of the mothers and daughters being interviewed. Descriptions of the types which were identified for mothers and daughters follow.

Mother Types

- 1) Structure/Rule Enforcer mothers were mothers who stressed rules and obedience and emphasized traditional sex roles.
- 2) Communication/Relationship Mothers stressed the importance of developing a relationship based on open communication.
- 3) Independent/Individual Development Mothers believed in the importance of providing a climate in which daughters could develop autonomy.
- 4) Structure/Relationship Mothers placed an emphasis on setting rules, as well as the importance of teaching values and responsibility. Simultaneous with the process of providing structure, mothers in this group also placed importance on developing and maintaining a relationship with their daughters.

Daughter Types

- 1) Good/Guilty Daughters strived to honor and obey their mothers.
- 2) Conflicted Daughters wanted to develop an identity of their own, but were unsure of how to achieve this and still remain close to their mothers.
- 3) Withholding Daughters develop autonomy through withholding and privately processing information with little apparent inner conflict.
- 4) Secure Daughters have resolved the conflict of asserting independence while still remaining close to their mothers.

These classifications for mothers and daughters were used as models in conceptualizing the construct of orientation for the present study. As with the earlier study, (Kizielewicz, 1988) the possibility of additional mother and daughter types emerging from the new data was considered.

METHOD

Sample

A stratified random sample of twenty-four African American mothers and daughters was selected from a mid-sized urban high school in upstate New York. The sampling frame was constructed from the class list of all ninth and tenth grade students attending the selected school. The school was

process, 4) expectations for self and other, and 5) feelings about the relationship and each other. The interview format and items for both the mother and daughter were identical with one exception: each mother was also asked to talk about her relationship with her own mother when she was growing up.

Procedure

Each daughter selected was contacted by the school counselor and the purpose of the study was explained. After verbally indicating her interest in participating, each daughter was asked to discuss the study with her mother. A follow-up phone call was made to the mother by the school counselor. This same school counselor was familiar with the purposes of the study, as he had assisted in the selection process for participants in the earlier study. The counselor was also knowledgeable of the interview questions and procedures, and was thus able to answer any preliminary questions the mothers had. After the mother agreed to be interviewed, she was contacted by the interviewer to schedule an interview time. Confirmations of appointments were mailed to each of the participants. (see Appendix B). Interviews were conducted by two African American masters level counselor education students.

All mothers and daughters were interviewed in their homes. Mothers and daughters were interviewed separately and the interviews were scheduled so that mothers and daughters did not have an opportunity to interact with each other until

chosen because school census data indicated a diversity of race and social class represented in the student body and the same school was used for the earlier study of Caucasian mothers and daughters (Kizielewicz, 1988). Using a random start, the name of every fourth African American daughter was identified. A school official, knowledgeable of all ninth and tenth grade students verified the race of each student and estimated socioeconomic status based upon personal knowledge of the student and the current family residence.

The intent was to secure twelve dyads from middle class families and twelve from working class families.

Socioeconomic status was computed by using Hollingshead's Four Factor Index of Social Status (Hollingshead, 1979). This index is scaled using the education, occupation, sex, and marital status of the adult members of the household.

Twenty-eight names were originally selected. Nine of the original sample agreed to participate, and therefore the process of name selection was repeated until the final number of participants was obtained.

Instrumentation

Interview Protocol

The interview protocol (Appendix A), developed by this researcher was used in the earlier study (Kizielewicz, 1988). The five areas of the mother-daughter relationship covered in the interview protocol were: 1) time spent together, 2) the definition and implication of roles, 3) the communication

and the possibility of the existence of additional mother and daughter types was recognized. Procedures for the induction of new types are also outlined in the coding manual.

Data Analysis

After the formal interview was complete, each audio tape was transcribed, and data were analyzed qualitatively by a combination of listening to audio tapes and reading transcripts of the interviews. Themes were extracted through a process that combined induction and comparison. Using the criteria identified in the earlier study (Kizielewicz, 1988), and outlined in the coding manual (Appendix C), mothers and daughters were grouped according to type. Mother-daughter combinations were then formed by looking at the mother types and the respective daughter types together. Each subgroup was then studied for similarities and differences in the ways in which dyads communicated, expressed affection, and engaged in disagreements within the relationship. Data were further analyzed in respect to social class.

RESULTS

The Mothers

A total of 50 mothers and daughters were contacted in order to obtain the required 24 participants for the study. Some of the mothers and daughters who originally agreed to participate in the study either did not keep repeated scheduled appointments or at the time of the appointment,

the process was completed. Each of the women signed a consent form (Appendix B) at the beginning of the interview. Interviews were audio-taped and averaged approximately one hour in length. At the conclusion of each interview, notes were made by the researchers, recording observations of the interview process.

Coding Procedures

The transcripts of the mother-daughter interviews were read and coded in accordance with the procedures outlined in the coding manual (Appendix C). Mother and daughter types were identified by this researcher and a masters level graduate student who was familiar with the purposes and procedures of the original study as well as this research project.

Using the prescribed procedures, each mother and daughter was assigned to a specific grouping. Transcriptions were read and classified separately by the two readers and in all cases a consensus on classifications was reached between the researcher and research assistant.

The construction and identification of the mother and daughter types were intended to represent mutually exclusive categories. Placement in a category was based upon the predominant theme in the ideas and beliefs expressed throughout the interview. The procedures as outlined in Appendix C presented specific guidelines for reaching consensus. This study was intended to be theory generating

they indicated that they had changed their minds. Mothers ranged from 28 to 61 years of age. Eleven of the mothers were married, one was widowed, and ten were single. Fifteen of the mothers were classified as working class and seven were classified as middle class. Table 1 below presents a summary of each mother's marital status, age and social class.

TABLE 1

<u>Mother</u>	<u>SES</u>	<u>Marital Status</u>	<u>Age</u>
M40	WC	Married	38
M41	MC	Single	41
M42	WC	Single	41
M43	WC	Single	52
M44	WC	Single	46
M45	MC	Single	35
M46	MC	Married	45
M47	WC	Widowed	61
M48	recording inaudible		na
M49	WC	Single	33
M50	not interviewed		na
M50A	WC	Married	41
M51	WC	Single	28
M52	MC	Single	38
M53	WC	Married	na
M54	MC	Married	45
M55	WC	Married	46
M56	MC	Married	34
M57	WC	Married	46
M58	WC	Single	35
M59	WC	Single	na
M60	MC	Married	38
M61	WC	Single	na
M62	WC	Married	34
M63	WC	Married	42

WC=working class; MC= middle class; na=not available

Table B, below presents a summary of the mothers who were classified as Structure Rule Enforcer.

Table B

Structure Rule Enforcer Mothers

	M40	M42	M44	M47	M55	M58	M59	M63
Social Class	WC	WC	WC	WC	WC	WC	WC	WC
Marital Status	MAR	SING	SING	WID	MAR	SING	SING	MAR

wc=working class

mar=married; sing=not married; wid=widowed

Table C below presents a summary of the mothers who were classified as Structure Relationship.

Table C

Structure Relationship Mothers

	M45	M49	M56	M57	M60
Social Class	MC	WC	MC	WC	MC
Marital Status	SING	SING	MAR	MAR	MAR

wc=working class; mc=middle class

mar=married; sing=not married

Table D below presents a summary of the mothers who were classified as Communication Relationship.

Table D

Communication Relationship Mothers

	M43	M46	M52	M61
Social Class	WC	MC	MC	WC
Marital Status	SING	MAR	SING	SING

wc=working class; mc=middle class
mar=married; sing=not married;

Table E below presents a summary of the mothers who were classified as Independent Developmental.

Table E

Independent Developmental Mothers

	M41	M50A	M51	M53	M54	M62
Social Class	MC	WC	WC	WC	MC	WC
Marital Status	SING	MAR	SING	MAR	SING	MAR

wc=working class; mc=middle class
mar=married; sing=not married;

The Daughters

The daughters ranged from 14 to 17 years of age. Table F below presents a summary of the daughters, their ages and types.

TABLE F

<u>Daughter</u>	<u>Type</u>	<u>Age</u>
D40	SECURE	16
D41	SECURE	16
D42	GOOD/GUILTY	16
D43	CONFLICTED	16
D44	DETACHED	16
D45	SECURE	16
D46	GOOD/GUILTY	15
D47	WITHHOLDING	16
D48	didn't record	
D49	SECURE	16
D50	SECURE	16
D50A	CONFLICTED	16
D51	not interviewed	
D52	GOOD/GUILTY	17
D53	DETACHED	16
D54	SECURE	16
D55	CONFLICTED	15
D56	GOOD/GUILTY	14
D57	WITHHOLDING	15
D58	no code	15
D59	CONFLICTED	15
D60	CONFLICTED	15
D61	no data	
D62	GOOD/GUILTY	15
D63	DETACHED	16

The coding of the daughter transcripts resulted in a new daughter type being identified. The type was called Detached. Three daughters from this group were classified as detached daughters.

The good mother is described by these daughters as:

... she doesn't hit you or argue with you
or nag you. She lets you do what you want.

The good daughter to daughters in this group " does what she wants, but tries to stay out of trouble."

The unique characteristic about the daughters in this group that was different from other daughters in both studies is a seeming disinterest in mother, her role in the family and the mother-daughter relationship. Daughters in this category reported sharing little or no information with their mothers. They reported talking with their mothers only when absolutely necessary. Arguments with daughters in this category are one sided with the mother talking and the daughter keeping thoughts and feelings to herself. The thoughts and feelings the daughter may have about the relationship or the process of arguing were also withheld from the interviewers. Daughters in this group reported no expectations for the relationship. When asked what they wanted from their mothers, the reply was "... for her to leave me alone and let me do what I want..".

Mothers and Daughters

Tables G thru I present each of the mother types and daughter types together beginning with Structure/Rule Enforcer Mothers and their daughters.

Table G

Structure Rule Enforcer Mothers

	M40	M42	M44	M47	M55	M58	M59	M63
Daughter Type	SEC	G/G	DET	WITH	CON	**	CON	DET

sec=secure; g/g=good guilty; det=detached; with=withholding;
con=conflicted ; **= no code

Table H

Structure Relationship Mothers

	M45	M49	M56	M57	M60
Daughter type	SEC	SEC	G/G	WITH	CON

sec=secure; g/g=good guilty; det=detached; with=withholding;
con=conflicted

Table I

Communication Relationship Mothers

	M43	M46	M52	M61
Daughter Type	CON	G/G	G/G	NA

sec=secure; g/g=good guilty; det=detached; with=withholding;
con=conflicted; na=not available

Table J

Independent Developmental Mothers

	M41	M50A	M51	M53	M54	M62
Daughter Type	SEC	CON	NA	DET	SEC	G/G

sec=secure; g/g=good guilty; det=detached; with=withholding;
con=conflicted; na=not available

DISCUSSION

In the introduction to this study the relationship between mother type and social class was discussed. The results of the original study (Kizielewicz, 1988) upon which this research was modeled indicated that Structure/Rule Enforcer mothers were working class whereas the Communication/Relationship and Independent Developmental mothers were middle class. The orientations of these mothers were consistent by class with the orientations of the parents studied by Dannefer (1986), Duvall (1946), Gecas (1979), Kohn

(1977) and others.

In the present study, social class continues to be a strong variable in the formulation of mother types. All of the Structure/Rule Enforcer mothers were working class. These women consistently stated beliefs which emphasized rules and authority. Middle class mothers, whether in single or two parent households, were categorized as either Structure/ Relationship, Communication/Relationship or Independent/ Developmental. These women espoused beliefs about the importance of independence, self reliance and personal expression.

Kohn's (1977) work on the relationship between class and parental values and Dannefer's (1986) study of the relationship between class, values and parenting practices were all conducted in two parent Caucasian families. The present research studied African American mothers and daughters in both single and dual parent households. While the class distinctions of the mothers in two parent households parallel those described in earlier studies, the orientations and practices of the single working class mothers are not congruent with traditional class distinctions and therefore challenge previous research findings.

The group of unmarried, working class mothers interviewed for this study were classified as either Structure/ Rule Enforcer (n=3), Structure/Relationship (n=1), Communication/Relationship (n=2) or Independent/Developmental (n=1). Although the limited size of this sample precludes

generalizability, the presence of this new way of viewing the relationship between class and orientation bears discussion.

Orientations which were previously considered middle class now apply to the single working class mothers in this study. All of the women in this group have been single mothers for the majority of their daughters' lives. Criteria used in earlier studies of social class and parenting values and practices were based upon two parent, Caucasian homes in which the man was the head of the household. The possibility now exists that the same criteria do not apply when the woman is the head of the household.

Examples from other research paradigms (Horney, 1967; Gilligan, 1979, 1982) support a second look at previously accepted criteria. These researchers challenged the applicability of the male experience to both sexes, and illustrated ways in which the experiences of women are unique. Horney (1967) challenged Freud's theory of personality as being biased toward men. She theorized with supporting evidence from her practice of psychoanalysis with women, that Freudian analysis was incorrect. Although, long dismissed, her theories of feminine psychology now form the cornerstone for modern thinking about women's development.

More recently, Gilligan (1979, 1982) has speculated that life cycle theory has been developed solely on the experiences of men. Gilligan's theory of moral development has offered a beginning for support that women's development is indeed different.

Theory about working class families has been developed through the process of studying values and practices in two parent homes. The work of Kohn (1977) uses the father's occupation and involvement in work as a major variable related to values espoused in the home. While Dannefer (1986) interviewed both parents, data are presented as parental statements and are only occasionally specifically delineated by the gender of the parent. Kizielewicz (1988) interviewed mothers in both single and dual parent households. Her sample, however, was limited to White American participants.

The results from this study support the findings of the earlier study by Kizielewicz (1988) and again emphasize the importance of viewing interactions within the mother-daughter relationship as unique and not determined by universal criteria. Furthermore, these findings support the importance of the modification of research perspectives to include variations in the unique dimensions of orientation, social class, and parenting practices for women of color.

The results of this study present several themes which will be further analyzed at a future time using the existing data.

Depression

Mothers within this study, regardless of classification, consistently talked about experiencing a sense of aloneness, helplessness and depression. These feelings seemed to generate from an inability of mothers to provide for their

daughters given restrictions placed upon them by self expectations and economic pressures. Further writings will explore these issues in more descriptive depth, as this seems to be an important clinical issue in counseling.

Detached Daughters and their Mothers

The new classification of Detached Daughters which was identified in this study is worthy of further investigation. The mothers of two of these daughters were classified as Structure/Rule Enforcer and the remaining mother was classified as Independent/Developmental. A detailed analysis of these three dyads will help in the understanding of the dynamics which exist in these relationships and will help women and counselors in their understandings of similar relationships.

Handicapping Conditions

Three of the daughters in this study (D52, D58, D62) were discovered to have learning disabilities. The presence of this condition resulted in the daughters having difficulty understanding and being able to conceptualize some of the questions which were asked in the interview. In two cases coding of the daughters was possible, but in the third case coding was difficult, and the researchers decided a more accurate category was non-coded. Analysis of the dynamics of these three dyads can shed additional light on the ways in which mothers and daughters have adjusted to these

challenges.

Cultural Differences

While the mother-daughter types and configurations by social class were similar between the Caucasian and African American samples interviewed, differences in specific practices were observed. Examples of differences are found in the ways in which discussions about education and sexuality occur and the way in which discipline is viewed within the family structure. Differences were also observed in the manner in which mothers and daughters argued. African American daughters were less verbal when arguing with their mothers than Caucasian daughters. African American daughters were also less likely than Caucasian daughters to outwardly express displeasure with or anger toward their mothers. Future writings will investigate the differences between cultures in the ways in which mothers and daughters communicated, argued and expressed affection.

Sexuality

All of the mothers in this study expressed concerns about their daughters' sexuality, and worries over adolescent pregnancy. Many of the mothers believed sexual involvement before marriage as inevitable with their daughters. Mothers were also concerned that early, unwanted pregnancies would mean responsibility for both mother and daughter.

Furthermore, future educational opportunities and hopes

for advancement would be diminished for the daughter. Mothers, therefore, offered assistance to their daughters in obtaining medical information and birth control methods. Future writings will present more descriptive data and information which will enhance the understanding of the nature of this issue and the implications for the daughter's development and the mother/daughter relationship.

IMPLICATIONS

The purposes of this study were to describe the similarities and differences in the process which occurs as mothers and adolescent daughters in African American families relate to each other in respect to communication, conflict, and the expression of affection, to provide information to assess existing theory regarding the mother-adolescent daughter in relationship to African American families, and to generate theory to be tested and used when counseling African Americans.

This study has illustrated a consistent relationship between orientation and the nature of mother-daughter interactions within identified classifications. The relationship between orientation and mother-daughter interactions was further ordered in respect to social class. The study also illustrates the unique nature of the orientations of the women studied.

Apprising women of the wide range of variations which are possible in the mother-daughter relationship will help

them to understand that a typical mother-daughter relationship perhaps does not exist. The women interviewed for this research are already defining their own mother-daughter relationships, as were the mothers and daughters in the previous study (Kizielewicz, 1988). When women are empowered with the knowledge that each mother-daughter relationship is unique and defined by the two women who are involved, they will recognize and accept that only one viable standard exists--their own. Clinicians and educators can assist women in the process of understanding and validating their orientation and the ways in which interactions occur within the mother-daughter relationship.

CONCLUSIONS

This study employed an intensive, semi-structured interview format using a case study design. The result of this design is that the researcher has generated rich descriptive data about the mother-daughter relationship to be further analyzed. The randomly generated sample also adds to the strength of the study. The interviews were all conducted by a researchers who had extensive experience in counseling and interviewing. The combination of these two areas of expertise during the interview process created a safe comfortable atmosphere for the research participants and contributed to the rich data.

The small size of the sample precludes generalizability.

Future research on larger or similar samples is needed in order to address the many issues identified in this study and to validate and extend this research.

Countless speculative directions are possible from the current study, only some of which appear here. The study has the potential to offer to mothers and daughters alike increased self knowledge and self understanding. The findings on the interrelationships between social class, orientation and parenting practices present new knowledge about the experience of the mother-daughter relationship.

REFERENCES

- Arcana, J. (1979). Our Mother's Daughters. Berkeley: Shameless Hussy Press.
- Caplan, P. J. (1981). Barriers Between Women. New York: Spectrum Publications.
- Chodorow, N. (1978). The Reproduction of Mothering. Berkeley: University of California Press.
- Dannefer, W. D. (1986). Parenting practices in middle and working class families: autocracy, democracy or bureaucracy? Unpublished manuscript, University of Rochester, Rochester, and Andrus Gerontology Center, University of Southern California, Los Angeles.
- Duvall, E. M. (1946). Conceptions of parenthood. American Journal of Sociology, 52(November), 193-203.
- Elder, G. H. & Bowerman, C. E. (1963). Family structure and childrearing patterns: the effect of family size and sex composition. American Sociological Review, 28, 891-905.
- Fischer, L. R. (1981). Transitions in the mother-daughter relationship. Journal of Marriage and the Family, 43(3), 613-622.
- Fischer, L. R. (1986). Linked Lives. New York: Harper & Row.
- Gecas, V. (1979). The influence of social class on socialization. In W. R. Burr, R. Hill, F. I. Nye, & I. L. Reiss (Eds.), Contemporary Theories About the Family. Vol 1. New York: Free Press.
- Gilbert, L. & Webster, P. (1982). Bound By Love: The Sweet Trap of Daughterhood. Boston: Beacon Press.
- Gilligan, C. (1982). In a Different Voice. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press.
- Gilligan, C. (1979). Women's place in man's life cycle. Harvard Educational Review, 49(4), 431-446.
- Hollingshead, A. (1979). Four factor index of social status. Unpublished manuscript, Yale University, New Haven.
- Horney, K. (1967). Feminine Psychology. New York: Norton.
- Kizielewicz, N. L. (1988). The Mother Adolescent Daughter Relationship: A Study of Ideological Orientations, Social Class and Parenting Practices. Unpublished manuscript,

University of Rochester, Rochester.

- Kohn, M. L. (1977). Class and Conformity: A Study in Values. (2nd ed.). Chicago: University of Chicago Press.
- Lerner, H. G. (1985). The Dance of Anger. New York: Harper & Row, Inc.
- Mahler, M. S. (1982). Aggression in the service of separation-individuation: a case study of a mother-daughter relationship. The Psychoanalytic Quarterly, 50(4), 625-638.
- Tannen, D. (1986). That's Not What I Meant. New York: William Morrow and Company, Inc.
- Walker, A., & Thompson, L. (1983). Intimacy and intergenerational aid and contact among mothers and daughters. Journal of Marriage and the Family, 45(4), 841-849.

APPENDIX A

MOTHER INTERVIEW

PURPOSE: To talk with mothers about their relationships with their daughters in order to begin to identify the ideas which mothers hold about their roles in their relationship with their daughters and to begin to describe characteristics of the process of communication, the manner in which affection is demonstrated and the nature and process of arguing which occurs between mothers and daughters.

TIME/SPACE: This group of questions will address your feelings about the amount of time you and your daughter spend together and the kinds of things you do together.

1. What are some things that you enjoy doing with your daughter?
2. About how much time do the two of you spend together alone?

IDEAS ABOUT THE ROLES: In this group of questions, I am interested in your perceptions and ideas about the role of mother and daughter-- the way you think it should be and the way in which it exists in your family.

1. In your mind, what is the good mother? (probe for examples and illustrations...Specificity)
2. Where do you think your ideas about the good mother came from? (probe for examples)
3. In what ways do you feel this definition of the good mother describes or does not describe the way you are with your daughter? (ask for specifics from the illustrations offered by the mother in her answers to question 1).
4. What is the good daughter? (probe for examples)
5. Where do you think your ideas about the good daughter came from?
6. In what ways do you feel that this definition of the good daughter describes or does not describe your daughter? (ask for specifics from the illustrations offered by mother in her answers to question 4).

COMMUNICATION: I would now like to talk with you about ways in which you and your daughter communicate, the things that help you to communicate with each other as well as the things that get in the way.

1. What kinds of topics are easy for you to talk about together?
2. What topics are difficult?
3. Does your daughter ever confide in you? (About what? Or Why do you think she doesn't)
4. When is the best time to talk with your daughter? How do you know this?
5. When is your daughter least receptive to you?
How do you know this?
6. Could you describe what usually happens when you and your daughter disagree?
7. What do you usually argue about?
8. Could you describe a recent argument or disagreement that you and your daughter had... what happened.. how did you feel during the argument... how about after. (probe for specifics)
9. Did you feel that the argument was settled? Why or why not?
10. What types of discussions do you and your daughter have regarding sex? (menstruation, intercourse, dating..)
11. From where do you think your daughter gets most of her information about sexual matters.

EXPECTATIONS: This next group of questions will talk about the goals or expectations that you have regarding your relationship with your daughter. (when global statements are used in this section, ask for examples- the goal is specificity. Example: if answer is happiness, probe: what so you think would be necessary for your daughter to be happy..)

1. What do you want for your daughter?
(probe: career or personal goals; do you think she's aware of this? How?)
2. What do you want from your daughter?
(probe: how does she know this?)
3. What does your daughter want from you?
(probe: how do you know this?)
4. What does your daughter want for you?
(probe: how do you know this?)

FEELINGS: I would now like to talk with you about your feelings about your daughter and your relationship with her. (the goal for this group of questions is again specificity. Probe for concrete examples of global concepts such as support, or happiness, or love.)

1. Could you describe times when you feel particularly close to your daughter? (ask for example)
2. Could you talk about times when you feel distant (not so close)? (ask for example)
3. Do you and your daughter ever talk about your relationship and how you feel about each other?
(probe: what's that like for you?)
4. Could you describe ways in which you express affection towards your daughter?
5. How does she respond?
6. Could you describe ways in which your daughter expresses affection towards you?
(how do you experience this?)

HISTORY: In this final group of questions, I am interested in learning more about your experiences as a daughter.

1. Could you describe your relationship with your mother as

you were growing up?

DEMOGRAPHICS: Age:

Occupation:

Husband's occupation:

Highest year of school husband completed

Highest year of school completed by mother:

Religion

DAUGHTER INTERVIEW

PURPOSE: To talk with daughters about their relationships with their mothers in order to begin to identify the ideas which daughters hold about their roles in their relationship with their mothers and to begin to describe characteristics of the process of communication and the manner in which affection is demonstrated, and the nature and process of arguing which occurs between mothers and daughters.

TIME/SPACE: This group of questions will address your feelings about the amount of time you and your mother spend together and the kinds of things you do together.

1. What are some things you enjoy doing with your mother?
2. About how much time do the two of you spend together alone?

IDEAS ABOUT THE ROLES: In this group of questions, I am interested in your perceptions and ideas about the role of daughter and mother-- the way you think it should be and the way in which it exists in your family.

1. In your mind, what is the good daughter? (probe for examples and specificity)
2. Where do you think your ideas about the good daughter came from? (probe for examples)
3. In what ways do you feel this definition of the good daughter describes or does not describe you? (ask for specifics from the illustrations offered by the daughter in her answers to question 1)
4. What is the good mother? (probe for examples)
5. Where do you think your ideas about the good mother came from?
6. In what ways do you feel that this definition of the good mother describes or does not describe your mother? (ask for specifics from the illustrations or examples which were offered in response to question 4).

COMMUNICATION: I would like to talk with you about ways in which you and your mother communicate, the things that help you to communicate with each other as well as the things that get in the way.

1. What kinds of topics are easy for you and your mother to talk about together?
2. What topics are difficult?
3. Does your mother ever confide in you? (About what, or why do you think she doesn't)
4. Is there a best time to talk to your mother?
How do you know this?
5. Could you describe what usually happens when you and your mother disagree?
6. What do you usually argue about?
7. Could you describe a recent argument or disagreement you and your mother had... What happened.. How did you feel during the argument.. How about after?
8. Do you feel that the argument was settled? Why or why not?
9. What types of discussions do you and your mother have regarding sex (menstruation, intercourse, dating...) (probe for information about where most of the information regarding sexual matters is obtained)

EXPECTATIONS: This next group of questions will talk about the goals or expectations that you have regarding your relationship with your mother. (when global statements are used in this section, ask for examples- the goal is specificity.

Example: if the answer is happiness, probe: what do you think would be necessary for happiness.)

1. What does your mother want for you? (How do you know this?)

2. What does your mother want from you? (How do you know this?)

3. What do you want from your mother? (Do you think she is aware of this?)

4. What do you want for your mother? (Do you think she knows this?)

FEELINGS: I would now like to talk with you about your feelings about your mother and your relationship with her. (the goal for this group of questions is again specificity. Probe for concrete examples of global concepts such as support, or happiness or love.)

1. Could you talk about any times when you feel particularly close to your mother? (probe for examples)

2. Could you talk about times when you feel distant (not so close)? (probe for examples)

3. Do you and your mother ever talk about your relationship and how you feel about each other?
(what's that like for you?)

4. Could you describe ways in which you express affection towards your mother?

5. How does she respond?

6. Could you describe ways in which your mother expresses affection towards you?
(how do you experience this?)

DEMOGRAPHICS: Age
Number, sex and age of siblings
Year in school
Area of study
School program
Present employment if any
Career goals

APPENDIX B

- 8) Participation is voluntary and I may withdraw at any time; if I choose to withdraw, the information that I have supplied will be destroyed;
- 9) Prior to the collection of the information, opportunity will be provided so that I may ask questions regarding the study;
- 10) The benefits that I may gain as a result of my participation include being able to contribute to a worthwhile research project which will help mothers and daughters to understand each other better, and to express my feelings about the mother-daughter relationship.

In addition, I understand that if I have any concerns regarding this study, I may contact Dr. Nancy Kizielewicz, the primary researcher this project (395-2258 or 328-2251).

STATEMENT OF CONSENT

You are being asked to make a decision whether or not to participate in the project. If you wish to participate and you agree with the statement below, please sign in the space provided. Remember, you may change your mind at any point and withdraw from the study.

I _____, having read (or had read to me) and understood the information provided in this form, agree to participate as a subject in this project.

Participant's signature

Date

Parent/guardian signature

Date

Interviewer's signature

Date

BROCKPORT

State University of New York
College at Brockport
Brockport, New York 14420

Department of Counselor Education
(716) 395-2258

PARTICIPANT (daughter) CONSENT FORM

I agree to participate in a study entitled: The Mother-Adolescent Daughter Relationship in Black American Families: a Study of Ideological Orientation, Social Class and Parenting Practices which is being conducted by Nancy Kizielewicz, Ed.D., Assistant Professor, at State University of New York, College at Brockport.

The purpose of the study is exploratory in nature, with the intent of beginning to identify characteristics of the interactions which occur between mothers and daughters. I understand that the interviewer will talk with me regarding my feelings about my mother and my relationship with her.

I understand that my participation will involve an audio taped interview regarding communication with, feelings about, and expectations for my mother and my relationship with her. The total time for the completion of the interview is approximately one hour.

I understand that:

- 1) There are no right or wrong answers to the items; the responses are my own opinion;
- 2) My responses will be confidential and my name will not appear in any written material;
- 3) My responses will be tape recorded, and will be listened to solely by the interviewer and the primary researcher;
- 4) My mother will also be participating in the study. Her participation will include an interview regarding communication with, feelings about and expectations for her relationship with me;
- 5) Information obtained from my mother is confidential and will not be shared with me;
- 6) The information collected will only be treated as group data;
- 7) There will be no physical, emotional or financial risk involved;

(over)

June, 1988

Mrs Jane Doe
Ms Margaret Doe
222 Home Street
Rochester, New York, 14619

Dear Jane and Margaret:

We would like to thank you for your willingness to participate in the research study The Mother-Adolescent Daughter Relationship in Black American Families.

As was indicated to you, we will be contacting you in the next month to schedule a time when we can meet. If you have any questions regarding the study or the interview, please do not hesitate to call (395-2258 or 328-2251). Thank you for your time and consideration. We look forward to meeting with you soon.

Sincerely,

Nancy Kizielewicz, Ed.D., N.C.C.
Assistant Professor
Project Director

Lonnie L. Mathis
Research Assistant

APPENDIX C

CODING PROCEDURES FOR MOTHER AND DAUGHTER TYPES

General Procedures

The following coding procedure is to be used to place mothers and daughters into appropriate categories. Two independent raters will separately and simultaneously follow the process outlined below.

- 1) Read each interview transcript in its entirety in order to gain a general understanding of the interview as a whole. During this first examination of the transcript, the reader will:
 - a) notice if all questions were answered
 - b) notice the extent to which questions were answered
 - c) achieve a general understanding of the interview process from the participant's point of view. (e.g. Were questions easily answered? Did the participant verbalize the ease or difficulty of answering questions)
 - d) begin to formulate hypotheses about possible mother or daughter type
- 2) Reread the transcript, this time attending specifically to sections of the interview which addressed ideas about roles and expectations. The specific questions are:
 - a) What is the good mother/daughter?
 - b) In what ways does this definition either describe you or not describe you?
 - c) In what ways does this definition either describe or not describe your mother/daughter?
 - d) What do you want from your mother/daughter?
 - e) What do you want for your mother/daughter?
- 3) Summarize and attempt to categorize the responses to the above questions based on the descriptions of the

model mother or daughter types outlined in this manual.

4) Compare the summary of responses to the descriptions of model mother or daughter types and further hypothesize about the mother or daughter type based upon the additional information from the identified questions.

5) Reexamine the transcript in its entirety, to find examples from responses to other questions which either support or negate the hypothesized mother or daughter type.

6) If a response is nebulous either because of specific wording or lack of clarity of explanation, listen to the audio tape for tone of voice or level of feeling expressed.

7) If possible, decide on a mother or daughter type. If you are not able to make a concrete decision at this point, set the transcript aside for discussion with the other rater.

8) Raters will compare classifications. Each mother and daughter will be reviewed and discussed. When both raters agree on the classification, the mother or daughter will be classified accordingly.

9) When raters do not initially agree on a specific category, they will, through discussion and comparison of mother and daughter classifications, will try to reach consensus by citing specific examples from the text to support a classification.

10) If consensus cannot be reached, raters will again review the transcript and exchange rationales for classification.

The possibility exists that current classifications may not be adequate. If after following the above guideline, either a classification cannot be made, or consensus cannot be reached, raters need to consider the possible existence of a yet to be defined category. Should this situation occur, the raters will follow the guidelines listed below. This time the raters will work together on each transcript in question.

- 1) Using the process outlined above list the key characteristics of the mother or daughter in question (see guideline #2).
- 2) Compare the identified characteristics to existing categories once more to rule out their application to preexisting classifications.
- 3) If both raters agree that the mother or daughter in question cannot be classified by existing types, then a new type must be considered.
- 4) When considering a new type, the raters need to decide whether the new type is an extension of an existing type or is in fact a free standing mother or daughter type.
- 5) The naming of new mother or daughter types is left to the insights and creativity of current raters. Care should be taken, however, in providing appropriately descriptive labels.

Descriptions of Mother Types

The following descriptions of mother and daughter categories are to be used as guides in the current classification of mothers and daughters.

Structure Rule Enforcer Mother

- 1) perceives her role as protector and caretaker of the daughter
 - e.g. "The good mother sets the rules for her daughter"
 - "The good mother trains her daughter to do the right thing by enforcing the rules of the house"
- 2) her primary responsibility as mother is to set and enforce rules.
 - e.g. "The good daughter does what her mother tells her to do"
- 3) expects her daughter to honor and obey her.
 - e.g. "The good mother should stay home and take care of the house"
- 4) espouses to traditional sex roles.

"The good daughter stays home and helps the mother around the house"

"I want my daughter to marry and have a family"

Communication Relationship Mother

- 1) perceives her role as a friendly and open confidant.
e.g. "The good mother is always there willing to talk and listen to her daughter"
- 2) The good mother is available to talk and spend time with the daughter
e.g. "I don't care if I have a clean house or cookies in the cookie jar, I would rather spend time with my daughter"
- 3) She believes in the importance in modeling behaviors for her daughter.
e.g. "I want to set a good example for my daughter"
"When she thinks about me I want her to remember the things I showed her through my example"
- 4) Her goal is to produce a daughter who is kind caring and loving.
e.g. "The good daughter is one who talks to her mother, things of her mother and spends time with her mother"
- 5) Developing and maintaining a relationship is important
e.g. "What do I want? A continued relationship, of course"

Independent Developmental Mother

- 1) The good mothers develops her own self confidence and self awareness
e.g. "the good mother is someone who is open to new ideas"
"The good mother is someone who is always learning about herself."
- 2) Her role is to accept her daughter and help her daughter

in the process of self development

e.g. "I want my daughter to develop to her fullest potential"

"I want my daughter to know that she has choices"

"I want my daughter to make informed choices for herself"

3) The good mother is careful not to judge her daughter

e.g. "I know sometimes I would like for her to be different, But she is who she is"

4) The good daughter for these mothers respects herself and is independent.

e.g. "The good daughter is fun to be with. She enjoys herself"

Descriptions of Daughter Types

Good/Guilty Daughter

1) The good daughter obeys and always tries to please her mother.

e.g. "The good daughter does everything she is told to do without asking questions"

2) The good daughter does not cause problems for the family

e.g. "The good daughter doesn't argue"
"I don't always agree, but she's my mother and she knows best"

3) She strives to be the perfect daughter and expresses guilt when she cannot.

e.g. "I try to be what my mother wants, but sometimes I'm not. I guess I have to try harder"

"Things would be better at home if I were better"

4) Does not define herself as separate from her mother.

e.g. "My mother and I are close to each other"
"I want to be more like her"

Conflicted Daughter

- 1) The good daughter tries not to cause problems in the family.
 e.g. "I guess the good daughter would not do anything to hurt her mother"
- 2) The good daughter tries to obey her mother and is loyal.
 e.g. " I always try to obey my mother. I want to be close to her"
 "I never put my mother down"
- 3) The good daughter is actively engaged in striving for independence.
 e.g. "I want to learn to do things on my own"
 "I'm my own person, you know"
- 4) Independence and closeness are viewed as mutually exclusive
 e.g. "Every time I do something on my own, I feel bad, like I'm leaving her out"
 "I want to be close to my mother, but I have my friends and my own life too. I feel bad when I have to choose"

Secure Daughter

- 1) The good daughter is caring, respectful and cooperative
 e.g. "the good daughter tries to listen to her mother's point of view"
 "The good daughter loves her mother and tries to consider her opinions"
- 2) She is actively engaged in striving for independence
 e.g. "I'm learning to do things on my own"
 "I have a job and buy most of my own clothes now"
- 3) She rarely censors information from her mother.

e.g. "I don't have to tell my mother everything, I know she is there when I need her"

"I like to talk to my mother about a lot of things... school, boys, friends"

4) She sees that independence and closeness can be achieved simultaneously.

e.g. "Sometimes I do things that she may not like, but I have to make my own decisions"

"We respect each other, even when we're arguing"

5) She sees continued growth in the relationship

e.g. "My mother and I may not always agree now, But I know when I get older, we'll still be there for each other"